Maximally Multi-Focused Proofs for Skew Non-Commutative MILL

Niccolò Veltri Tallinn University of Technology

WoLLIC'23, Halifax NS, 13 July 2023

Conference participation supported by COST CA19135 - Connecting Education and Research Communities for an Innovative Resource Aware Society

Permutative non-determinism

 In cut-free sequent calculi for various logical systems, there is lots of non-determinism in root-first proof search.

$$\frac{A, B, \Gamma \vdash C \quad \Delta \vdash D}{A, B, \Gamma, \Delta \vdash C \otimes D} \otimes \mathbb{R} \qquad \qquad \frac{A, B, \Gamma \vdash C}{A \otimes B, \Gamma \vdash C} \otimes \mathbb{L} \quad \Delta \vdash D}{A \otimes B, \Gamma, \Delta \vdash C \otimes D} \otimes \mathbb{R}$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash A}{A \multimap B, \Gamma, \Delta, \Omega \vdash C \otimes D} \stackrel{\otimes \mathsf{R}}{\to \mathsf{L}} \qquad \qquad \frac{\Gamma \vdash A}{A \multimap B, \Gamma, \Delta \vdash C} \stackrel{\otimes \mathsf{L}}{\to \mathsf{L}} \stackrel{\otimes \mathsf{R}}{\to \mathsf{L}} \qquad \qquad \frac{\Gamma \vdash A}{A \multimap B, \Gamma, \Delta \vdash C} \stackrel{\to \mathsf{L}}{\to \mathsf{L}} \stackrel{\otimes \mathsf{L}}{\to \mathsf{L}} \otimes \mathbb{R}$$

Focusing

- Andreoli's focusing is an established approach for reducing it. Organize proof search in two phases:
 - **1** Eagerly apply invertible rules, like \otimes L.
 - **2** Pick a formula and apply non-invertible rules to it, like $\otimes R$, $-\circ L$.

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ■ ●の00

• Multi-focusing: possibly focus on more than one formula in phase 2.

Focusing

- Andreoli's focusing is an established approach for reducing it. Organize proof search in two phases:
 - **1** Eagerly apply invertible rules, like \otimes L.
 - **2** Pick a formula and apply non-invertible rules to it, like $\otimes R$, $-\circ L$.
- Multi-focusing: possibly focus on more than one formula in phase 2.
- To eliminate all permutative non-determinism, usual solutions switch to a different formalism, e.g. proof nets.
- But permutative canonicity can be achieved in sequent calculus as well via maximally multi-focused proofs (Chaudhuri, Miller & Saurin'08).

Content of the talk

The objective of the project:

• Comprehensive study of maximal multi-focused deductive systems for substructural logics.

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□ ● ● ●

• Development of proof-theoretic investigations of logical systems in interactive theorem provers.

Content of the talk

The objective of the project:

- Comprehensive study of maximal multi-focused deductive systems for substructural logics.
- Development of proof-theoretic investigations of logical systems in interactive theorem provers.

In this talk:

• Maximal multi-focusing for skew non-commutative multiplicative linear logic (SkNMILL).

- This logic is a semi-associative and semi-unital variant of Lambek calculus with one implication.
- Fully formalized in the Agda proof assistant.

Content of the talk

The objective of the project:

- Comprehensive study of maximal multi-focused deductive systems for substructural logics.
- Development of proof-theoretic investigations of logical systems in interactive theorem provers.

In this talk:

- Maximal multi-focusing for skew non-commutative multiplicative linear logic (SkNMILL).
- This logic is a semi-associative and semi-unital variant of Lambek calculus with one implication.
- Fully formalized in the Agda proof assistant.

Why SkNMILL?

• In multi-focusing phase, at most two formulae can be under focus.

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□ ● ● ●

• Richer substructural logics are extensions.

▲□▶▲□▶▲≡▶▲≡▶ ≡ めぬる

• Formulae: $A, B ::= X \in At \mid I \mid A \otimes B \mid A \multimap B$ $I, A \otimes B$ positive, $A \multimap B$ negative

- Formulae: $A, B ::= X \in At \mid I \mid A \otimes B \mid A \multimap B$ $I, A \otimes B$ positive, $A \multimap B$ negative
- Sequents are triples $S \mid \Gamma \vdash C$ where
 - S (stoup) is an optional formula,
 - Γ (*context*) is an ordered list of formulae,
 - C is a single formula.

- Formulae: $A, B ::= X \in At \mid I \mid A \otimes B \mid A \multimap B$ $I, A \otimes B$ positive, $A \multimap B$ negative
- Sequents are triples $S \mid \Gamma \vdash C$ where
 - S (stoup) is an optional formula,
 - Γ (context) is an ordered list of formulae,
 - C is a single formula.

• Derivations constructed via inference rules:

$$\frac{1}{X | \vdash X} \text{ ax } \frac{1}{-| \vdash I} I \mathbb{R} \quad \frac{S | \Gamma \vdash A - | \Delta \vdash B}{S | \Gamma, \Delta \vdash A \otimes B} \otimes \mathbb{R} \quad \frac{S | \Gamma, A \vdash B}{S | \Gamma \vdash A - B} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$$

$$\frac{A | \Gamma \vdash C}{-| A, \Gamma \vdash C} \text{ pass } \frac{-| \Gamma \vdash C}{I | \Gamma \vdash C} I \mathbb{L} \quad \frac{A | B, \Gamma \vdash C}{A \otimes B | \Gamma \vdash C} \otimes \mathbb{L} \quad \frac{-| \Gamma \vdash A - B | \Delta \vdash C}{A - B | \Gamma, \Delta \vdash C} \rightarrow \mathbb{L}$$

・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・

- Formulae: $A, B ::= X \in At \mid I \mid A \otimes B \mid A \multimap B$ $I, A \otimes B$ positive, $A \multimap B$ negative
- Sequents are triples $S \mid \Gamma \vdash C$ where
 - S (stoup) is an optional formula,
 - Γ (context) is an ordered list of formulae,
 - C is a single formula.

• Derivations constructed via inference rules:

$$\frac{1}{X | \vdash X} \Rightarrow \frac{1}{-| \vdash I} R \quad \frac{S | \Gamma \vdash A - | \Delta \vdash B}{S | \Gamma, \Delta \vdash A \otimes B} \otimes R \quad \frac{S | \Gamma, A \vdash B}{S | \Gamma \vdash A - B} \rightarrow R$$

$$\frac{A | \Gamma \vdash C}{-| A, \Gamma \vdash C} pass \quad \frac{-| \Gamma \vdash C}{I | \Gamma \vdash C} IL \quad \frac{A | B, \Gamma \vdash C}{A \otimes B | \Gamma \vdash C} \otimes L \quad \frac{-| \Gamma \vdash A - B | \Delta \vdash C}{A - B | \Gamma, \Delta \vdash C} \rightarrow L$$

• L-rules only apply to the formula in the stoup

- Formulae: $A, B ::= X \in At \mid I \mid A \otimes B \mid A \multimap B$ $I, A \otimes B$ positive, $A \multimap B$ negative
- Sequents are triples $S \mid \Gamma \vdash C$ where
 - S (stoup) is an optional formula,
 - Γ (context) is an ordered list of formulae,
 - C is a single formula.

• Derivations constructed via inference rules:

$$\frac{1}{X | \vdash X} \Rightarrow \frac{1}{-| \vdash I} I \mathbb{R} \quad \frac{S | \Gamma \vdash A - | \Delta \vdash B}{S | \Gamma, \Delta \vdash A \otimes B} \otimes \mathbb{R} \quad \frac{S | \Gamma, A \vdash B}{S | \Gamma \vdash A - B} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$$

$$\frac{A | \Gamma \vdash C}{-| A, \Gamma \vdash C} pass \quad \frac{-| \Gamma \vdash C}{I | \Gamma \vdash C} I \mathbb{L} \quad \frac{A | B, \Gamma \vdash C}{A \otimes B | \Gamma \vdash C} \otimes \mathbb{L} \quad \frac{-| \Gamma \vdash A - B | \Delta \vdash C}{A - B | \Gamma, \Delta \vdash C} \rightarrow \mathbb{L}$$

・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・
 ・

• L-rules only apply to the formula in the stoup

 $\bullet \otimes \mathsf{R}$ sends the stoup formula (if present) to the first premise

- Formulae: $A, B ::= X \in At \mid I \mid A \otimes B \mid A \multimap B$ $I, A \otimes B$ positive, $A \multimap B$ negative
- Sequents are triples $S \mid \Gamma \vdash C$ where
 - S (stoup) is an optional formula,
 - Γ (context) is an ordered list of formulae,
 - C is a single formula.

• Derivations constructed via inference rules:

$$\frac{1}{X | \vdash X} \Rightarrow \frac{1}{-| \vdash I} I \mathbb{R} \quad \frac{S | \Gamma \vdash A - | \Delta \vdash B}{S | \Gamma, \Delta \vdash A \otimes B} \otimes \mathbb{R} \quad \frac{S | \Gamma, A \vdash B}{S | \Gamma \vdash A - B} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$$

$$\frac{A | \Gamma \vdash C}{-| A, \Gamma \vdash C} pass \quad \frac{-| \Gamma \vdash C}{I | \Gamma \vdash C} I \mathbb{L} \quad \frac{A | B, \Gamma \vdash C}{A \otimes B | \Gamma \vdash C} \otimes \mathbb{L} \quad \frac{-| \Gamma \vdash A - B | \Delta \vdash C}{A - B | \Gamma, \Delta \vdash C} \rightarrow \mathbb{L}$$

- L-rules only apply to the formula in the stoup
- $\bullet \ \otimes \mathsf{R}$ sends the stoup formula (if present) to the first premise
- No structural rules of weakening, contraction, exchange

- Formulae: $A, B ::= X \in At \mid I \mid A \otimes B \mid A \multimap B$ $I, A \otimes B$ positive, $A \multimap B$ negative
- Sequents are triples $S \mid \Gamma \vdash C$ where
 - S (stoup) is an optional formula,
 - Γ (context) is an ordered list of formulae,
 - C is a single formula.

• Derivations constructed via inference rules:

$$\frac{1}{X | \vdash X} \Rightarrow \frac{1}{-| \vdash I} I \mathbb{R} \quad \frac{S | \Gamma \vdash A - | \Delta \vdash B}{S | \Gamma, \Delta \vdash A \otimes B} \otimes \mathbb{R} \quad \frac{S | \Gamma, A \vdash B}{S | \Gamma \vdash A - B} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$$

$$\frac{A | \Gamma \vdash C}{-| A, \Gamma \vdash C} pass \quad \frac{-| \Gamma \vdash C}{I | \Gamma \vdash C} I \mathbb{L} \quad \frac{A | B, \Gamma \vdash C}{A \otimes B | \Gamma \vdash C} \otimes \mathbb{L} \quad \frac{-| \Gamma \vdash A - B | \Delta \vdash C}{A - B | \Gamma, \Delta \vdash C} \rightarrow \mathbb{L}$$

- L-rules only apply to the formula in the stoup
- $\bullet \otimes \mathsf{R}$ sends the stoup formula (if present) to the first premise
- No structural rules of weakening, contraction, exchange
- New structural rule pass moving leftmost formula in context to the stoup, when latter is empty

Equivalence of derivations

- $f \stackrel{\circ}{=} g$ iff they are equal modulo permutative conversions
- Congruence $\stackrel{\circ}{=}$ generated by equations:

$$\otimes R (IL f, g) \stackrel{\circ}{=} IL (\otimes R (f, g)) \otimes R (\otimes L f, g) \stackrel{\circ}{=} \otimes L (\otimes R (f, g)) pass (-oR f) \stackrel{\circ}{=} -oR (pass f) IL (-oR f) \stackrel{\circ}{=} -oR (IL f) \otimes L (-oR f) \stackrel{\circ}{=} -oR (\otimes L f) -oL (f, -oR g) \stackrel{\circ}{=} -oR (-oL (f, g)) \otimes R (pass f, g) \stackrel{\circ}{=} pass (\otimes R (f, g)) \otimes R (-oL (f, g), h) \stackrel{\circ}{=} -oL (f, \otimes R (g, h))$$

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲ 三▶ ▲ 三▶ 三 のへぐ

Semi-associativity, semi-unitality

• These sequents are derivable:

$$\begin{array}{c|c} I \otimes A \mid & \vdash A \\ A \mid & \vdash A \otimes I \\ (A \otimes B) \otimes C \mid & \vdash A \otimes (B \otimes C) \end{array}$$

• These sequents are <u>not</u>:

$$\begin{array}{c|c} X & \forall I \otimes X \\ X \otimes I & \forall X \\ X \otimes (Y \otimes Z) & \forall (X \otimes Y) \otimes Z \end{array}$$

(ロ)、

• Categorical semantics in skew monoidal closed category (Street'13).

Invertible phase ↑

$$\frac{S \mid \Gamma, A \Uparrow B}{S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A \multimap B} \multimap \mathsf{R} \qquad \frac{A \mid B, \Gamma \Uparrow Q}{A \otimes B \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q} \otimes \mathsf{L} \qquad \frac{- \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q}{I \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q} I \mathsf{L} \qquad \frac{T \mid \Gamma \Downarrow Q}{T \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q} \text{ foc}$$

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲ 三▶ ▲ 三▶ 三三 - のへぐ

Invertible phase \Uparrow

$$\frac{S \mid \Gamma, A \Uparrow B}{S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A \multimap B} \multimap \mathsf{R} \qquad \frac{A \mid B, \Gamma \Uparrow Q}{A \otimes B \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q} \otimes \mathsf{L} \qquad \frac{- \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q}{I \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q} I \mathsf{L} \qquad \frac{T \mid \Gamma \Downarrow Q}{T \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q} \text{ foc}$$

Focusing phase \Downarrow

$$\frac{\mathcal{T} \mid \Gamma \Downarrow_{\mathsf{lf}} \mathcal{Q} \quad \begin{bmatrix} \bar{\mathcal{Q}} \end{bmatrix} \mid \Delta \Downarrow \begin{bmatrix} \bar{\mathcal{A}} \end{bmatrix}_{b}}{\mathcal{T} \mid \Gamma, \Delta \Downarrow \begin{bmatrix} \bar{\mathcal{A}} \end{bmatrix}_{b}} \quad \mathsf{foc}_{\mathsf{L}} \qquad \frac{\begin{bmatrix} \bar{\mathcal{S}} \end{bmatrix}_{b} \mid \Gamma \Downarrow \begin{bmatrix} \bar{\mathcal{T}} \end{bmatrix} \quad \mathcal{T} \mid \Delta \Downarrow_{\mathsf{rf}} \mathcal{Q}}{\begin{bmatrix} \bar{\mathcal{S}} \end{bmatrix}_{b} \mid \Gamma, \Delta \Downarrow \mathcal{Q}} \quad \mathsf{foc}_{\mathsf{R}}}$$
$$\frac{\frac{\mathcal{S} \mid \Gamma \Uparrow \mathcal{A} \quad \mathsf{UT}(b, c, S, A)}{\begin{bmatrix} \bar{\mathcal{S}} \end{bmatrix}_{b} \mid \Gamma \Downarrow \begin{bmatrix} \bar{\mathcal{A}} \end{bmatrix}_{c}} \quad \mathsf{unfoc}$$

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆ 臣▶ ◆ 臣▶ ○ 臣 ○ の Q @

Invertible phase \Uparrow

$$\frac{S \mid \Gamma, A \Uparrow B}{S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A \multimap B} \multimap \mathsf{R} \qquad \frac{A \mid B, \Gamma \Uparrow Q}{A \otimes B \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q} \otimes \mathsf{L} \qquad \frac{- \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q}{I \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q} I \mathsf{L} \qquad \frac{T \mid \Gamma \Downarrow Q}{T \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q} \text{ foc}$$

Focusing phase \Downarrow

$$\frac{T \mid \Gamma \Downarrow_{\mathrm{lf}} Q \quad \left[\bar{Q}\right] \mid \Delta \Downarrow \left[\bar{A}\right]_{b}}{T \mid \Gamma, \Delta \Downarrow \left[\bar{A}\right]_{b}} \quad \mathrm{foc}_{\mathrm{L}} \qquad \frac{\left[\bar{S}\right]_{b} \mid \Gamma \Downarrow \left[\bar{T}\right] \quad T \mid \Delta \Downarrow_{\mathrm{rf}} Q}{\left[\bar{S}\right]_{b} \mid \Gamma, \Delta \Downarrow Q} \quad \mathrm{foc}_{\mathrm{R}}$$

$$\frac{\overline{\left[\bar{X}\right]} \mid \Downarrow \left[\bar{X}\right]}{\left[\bar{X}\right] \mid \Downarrow \left[\bar{X}\right]} \text{ ax } \qquad \frac{S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A \quad \mathrm{UT}(b, c, S, A)}{\left[\bar{S}\right]_{b} \mid \Gamma \Downarrow \left[\bar{A}\right]_{c}} \quad \mathrm{unfoc}$$

Left-focusing phase \Downarrow_{If}

$$\frac{A \mid \Gamma \Downarrow_{\mathrm{lf}} Q}{- \mid A, \Gamma \Downarrow_{\mathrm{lf}} Q} \text{ pass } \frac{- \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A \quad B \mid \Delta \Downarrow_{\mathrm{lf}} Q}{A \multimap B \mid \Gamma, \Delta \Downarrow_{\mathrm{lf}} Q} \multimap \mathsf{L} \frac{- Q \mid \square_{\mathrm{lf}} Q}{Q \mid \square_{\mathrm{lf}} Q} \text{ blur}_{\mathrm{L}}$$

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲ 三▶ ▲ 三▶ 三 のへぐ

Invertible phase \Uparrow

$$\frac{S \mid \Gamma, A \Uparrow B}{S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A \multimap B} \multimap \mathsf{R} \qquad \frac{A \mid B, \Gamma \Uparrow Q}{A \otimes B \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q} \otimes \mathsf{L} \qquad \frac{- \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q}{I \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q} I \mathsf{L} \qquad \frac{T \mid \Gamma \Downarrow Q}{T \mid \Gamma \Uparrow Q} \text{ foc}$$

Focusing phase \Downarrow

$$\frac{T \mid \Gamma \Downarrow_{\mathrm{lf}} Q \quad \left[\bar{Q}\right] \mid \Delta \Downarrow \left[\bar{A}\right]_{b}}{T \mid \Gamma, \Delta \Downarrow \left[\bar{A}\right]_{b}} \text{ foc}_{\mathrm{L}} \qquad \frac{\left[\bar{S}\right]_{b} \mid \Gamma \Downarrow \left[\bar{T}\right] \quad T \mid \Delta \Downarrow_{\mathrm{rf}} Q}{\left[\bar{S}\right]_{b} \mid \Gamma, \Delta \Downarrow Q} \text{ foc}_{\mathrm{R}}$$

$$\frac{\overline{\left[\bar{X}\right]} \mid \Downarrow \left[\bar{X}\right]}{\left[\bar{X}\right] \mid \Downarrow \left[\bar{X}\right]} \text{ ax } \qquad \frac{S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A \quad \mathrm{UT}(b, c, S, A)}{\left[\bar{S}\right]_{b} \mid \Gamma \Downarrow \left[\bar{A}\right]_{c}} \text{ unfoc}$$

Left-focusing phase \Downarrow_{If}

$$\frac{A \mid \Gamma \Downarrow_{\mathsf{lf}} Q}{- \mid A, \Gamma \Downarrow_{\mathsf{lf}} Q} \text{ pass } \frac{- \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A \quad B \mid \Delta \Downarrow_{\mathsf{lf}} Q}{A \multimap B \mid \Gamma, \Delta \Downarrow_{\mathsf{lf}} Q} \multimap \mathsf{L} \frac{- Q \mid \neg_{\mathsf{lf}} Q}{Q \mid \neg_{\mathsf{lf}} Q} \text{ blur}_{\mathsf{L}}$$

Right-focusing phase \Downarrow_{rf}

$$\frac{1}{-\mid \ \ \Downarrow_{\text{rf}} I} IR \qquad \frac{T \mid \Gamma \Downarrow_{\text{rf}} A \quad -\mid \Delta \Uparrow B}{T \mid \Gamma, \Delta \Downarrow_{\text{rf}} A \otimes B} \otimes R \qquad \frac{1}{M \mid \ \Downarrow_{\text{rf}} M} \text{ blur}_{R}$$

Effective multi-focusing

Soundness and completeness

- An embedding function emb : $S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A \rightarrow S \mid \Gamma \vdash A$
- A focusing function focus : $S \mid \Gamma \vdash A \rightarrow S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A$

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□ ● ● ●

Effective multi-focusing

Soundness and completeness

- An embedding function emb : $S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A \rightarrow S \mid \Gamma \vdash A$
- A focusing function focus : $S \mid \Gamma \vdash A \rightarrow S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A$
- \bullet There exist \doteq -related proofs that are not identified by focus

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□ ● ● ●

• E.g. 4 distinct proofs of $X \multimap I \mid X, Y \Uparrow (Z \multimap Z) \otimes Y$

Effective multi-focusing

Soundness and completeness

- An embedding function emb : $S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A \rightarrow S \mid \Gamma \vdash A$
- A focusing function focus : $S \mid \Gamma \vdash A \rightarrow S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A$
- \bullet There exist \doteq -related proofs that are not identified by focus
- E.g. 4 distinct proofs of $X \multimap I \mid X, Y \Uparrow (Z \multimap Z) \otimes Y$

Equational soundness and completeness

 Capture the remaining non-determinism in a congruence [≗]_↑ on proofs of S | Γ ↑ A

Theorem

Maps focus and emb underlie an isomorphism:

$$(S \mid \Gamma \vdash A) / \stackrel{\circ}{=} \cong (S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A) / \stackrel{\circ}{=}_{\Uparrow}$$

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□ ● ● ●

Right-focusing before left-focusing?

 <u>Question</u>: When does a right-focusing phase need to be performed strictly before a left-focusing one? Strictly = separated by (at least one) invertible phase ↑.

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□ ● ● ●

Right-focusing before left-focusing?

- Question: When does a right-focusing phase need to be performed strictly before a left-focusing one?
 Strictly = separated by (at least one) invertible phase ↑.
- A proof of X → Y | Z ↑ (X → Y) ⊗ Z is obtained by focusing on the succedent, focusing on the stoup does not work.

$$\frac{-|X \Uparrow X \quad \overline{Y}| \quad \Downarrow_{\text{If }} \overline{Y} \quad \stackrel{\text{blur}_{\text{L}}}{\longrightarrow} \quad \stackrel{\text{blur}_{\text{L}}}{\stackrel{\rightarrow \text{L}}{\sum} \quad \stackrel{[\overline{Y}] \mid \ \Downarrow Y}{\longrightarrow} \quad \text{foc}_{\text{L}}} \\ \frac{\frac{X \multimap Y \mid X \Downarrow_{\text{If }} \overline{Y} \quad \stackrel{\rightarrow \text{L}}{\longrightarrow} \quad \stackrel{[\overline{Y}] \mid \ \Downarrow Y}{\overline{X \multimap Y \mid X \Uparrow Y}} \quad \text{foc}_{\text{L}}}{\frac{\overline{X \multimap Y \mid X \Uparrow Y}}{\overline{X \multimap Y \mid X \Uparrow Y}} \quad \text{foc}_{\text{L}}} \\ \frac{\frac{X \multimap Y \mid \ \square X \multimap Y}{\overline{X \multimap Y \mid X \Uparrow Y}} \quad \stackrel{\rightarrow \text{R}}{\longrightarrow} \quad \underset{\text{unfoc}}{\inf } \quad \frac{\overline{X \multimap Y \mid \ \Downarrow_{\text{rf}} X \multimap Y} \quad \stackrel{\text{blur}_{\text{R}}}{\overline{X \multimap Y \mid 2 \Downarrow_{\text{rf}} (X \multimap Y) \otimes Z}} \quad \text{foc}_{\text{R}}} \\ \frac{\frac{X \multimap Y \mid \ \square [\overline{X} \stackrel{\frown}{\longrightarrow} \stackrel{\rightarrow}{\longrightarrow}]}{\overline{X \multimap Y \mid Z \Downarrow (X \multimap Y) \otimes Z}} \quad \text{foc}_{\text{R}}} \quad \stackrel{\stackrel{\stackrel{\stackrel{\stackrel{\stackrel{\stackrel{\stackrel{\stackrel{\stackrel{\stackrel}{\longrightarrow}}}{\longrightarrow} R}}{\longrightarrow} Z}}{\xrightarrow{X \multimap Y \mid Z \Downarrow (X \multimap Y) \otimes Z}} \quad \text{foc}_{\text{R}}$$

Introducing tags

• <u>Answer</u>: when the subsequent left-focusing phase meaningfully employs new formulae appearing in context during invertible phase.

Introducing tags

• <u>Answer</u>: when the subsequent left-focusing phase meaningfully employs new formulae appearing in context during invertible phase.

• Our solution:

- Tag formulae in context: A new, A old
- Tag stoup: S no left-focusing in previous foc. phase, S o/w
- Tag succedent: C no right-focusing in previous foc. phase, C o/w

$$\frac{-|X \Uparrow X \quad \overline{Y}| \quad \psi_{\text{If } Y}}{X \multimap Y \mid X \psi_{\text{If } Y}} \stackrel{\text{blur}_{\text{L}}}{\to^{\text{L}} \quad [\underline{Y}] \mid \psi Y} \quad \text{foc}_{\text{L}} \\ \frac{X \multimap Y \mid X \psi_{\text{If } Y}}{X \multimap Y \mid X \Uparrow Y} \quad \text{foc}_{\text{L}} \\ \frac{X \multimap Y \mid X \Downarrow Y}{X \multimap Y \mid X \land Y} \quad \text{foc}_{\text{L}} \\ \frac{\overline{X \multimap Y \mid X \land Y}}{X \multimap Y \mid (\underline{X} \multimap Y)} \quad \text{onfoc} \qquad \overline{\overline{X \multimap Y \mid \psi_{\text{rf}} X \multimap Y}} \quad \frac{\text{blur}_{\text{R}} - |Z \Uparrow Z}{X \multimap Y \mid 2 \psi_{\text{rf}} (X \multimap Y) \otimes Z} \quad \text{foc}_{\text{R}} \\ \frac{\overline{X \multimap Y \mid \psi[X \multimap Y]}}{X \multimap Y \mid Z \Downarrow (X \multimap Y) \otimes Z} \quad \text{foc}_{\text{R}}$$

Maximally multi-focused sequent calculus (some rules)

Invertible phase \Uparrow_m

$$\frac{S \mid \Gamma, A \Uparrow_{\mathsf{m}} B}{S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow_{\mathsf{m}} A \multimap B} \multimap \mathsf{R} \qquad \frac{S \mid \Gamma, A \Uparrow_{\mathsf{m}} B}{S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow_{\mathsf{m}} A \multimap B} \multimap \mathsf{R} \qquad \dots$$

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲ □▶ ▲ □▶ □ のへぐ

Maximally multi-focused sequent calculus (some rules)

Invertible phase \Uparrow_m $\frac{S \mid \Gamma, A \Uparrow_{\mathsf{m}} B}{S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow_{\mathsf{m}} A \multimap B} \multimap \mathsf{R} \qquad \frac{S \mid \Gamma, A \Uparrow_{\mathsf{m}} B}{S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow_{\mathsf{m}} A \multimap B} \multimap \mathsf{R} \qquad \dots$ Focusing phase \Downarrow_m $\frac{T \mid \Gamma \Downarrow_{\text{lfm}} Q \quad \left[\bar{Q} \right] \mid \Delta \Downarrow_{\text{m}} A}{T \mid \Gamma, \Delta \Downarrow_{\text{m}} A} \text{ foc}_{\text{L}} \qquad \frac{T \mid \Gamma \Downarrow_{\text{lfm}} Q \quad \left[\bar{Q} \right] \mid \Delta \Downarrow_{\text{m}} A \quad \bullet \in \Gamma}{T \mid \Gamma, \Delta \Downarrow_{\text{m}} A} \text{ foc}_{\text{L}}$ $\frac{S^{\neg b} \mid \Gamma \Uparrow_{m} A^{\neg c} \quad \mathsf{UT}(b, c, S, A)}{\left\lceil \overline{S} \rceil_{c} \mid \Gamma \Downarrow_{m} \left\lceil \overline{A} \rceil_{c} \right\rceil} \quad \mathsf{unfoc} \quad \cdots$ $(S^{\text{true}} = \mathbf{S}, S^{\text{false}} = \mathbf{S}, A^{\text{true}} = \mathbf{A}, A^{\text{false}} = \mathbf{A})$

Left-focusing \Downarrow_{Ifm} and right-focusing phase \Downarrow_{rfm} are as before.

Effective maximization

Soundness and completeness

- An untagging function untag : $S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow_m A \rightarrow S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A$
- A maximization function max : $S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A \rightarrow S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow_m A$

Theorem

Maps max and untag underlie an isomorphism:

$$(S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow A) / \stackrel{\circ}{=}_{\Uparrow} \cong S \mid \Gamma \Uparrow_{\mathsf{m}} A$$

Corollary

$$(S | \Gamma \vdash A) / \stackrel{\circ}{=} \cong (S | \Gamma \Uparrow A) / \stackrel{\circ}{=}_{\Uparrow} \cong S | \Gamma \Uparrow_{\mathsf{m}} A$$

Conclusions

• Results fully formalized in Agda:

https://github.com/niccoloveltri/multifocus-sknmill

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ■ ●の00

• First steps towards formalization of maximal multi-focusing for richer substructural logics.

Conclusions

• Results fully formalized in Agda:

https://github.com/niccoloveltri/multifocus-sknmill

- First steps towards formalization of maximal multi-focusing for richer substructural logics.
- We have some ideas on how to extend the technique to other logics:
 - Full associativity and unitality for (\otimes, I) , exchange rule
 - Current work with Wan on adding additives (at LSFA'23)
- With Uustalu and Wan, we studied another class of normal forms for SkNMILL, where left-foc. rules are prioritized over right-foc. ones. Study the relationship between the two classes of normal forms.